

Tennessee Supreme Court

DISCRETIONARY APPEALS

Grants & Denials List May 14, 2018 - May 18, 2018

GRANTS

Style/Appeal Number	County/Trial Judge/ Trial Court No.	Intermediate Court	Supreme Court Action
<u>Nashville</u>			
ALFRED H. KNIGHT, ET AL. v. TYREE B. HARRIS, IV M2016-00909-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Chancery Court Ellen H. Lyle 11-1045-III	Armstrong, Kenny W.: Reverse in Part	Denied: Application of Alfred H. Knight et al. Order filed 5-17-18
OPRY MILLS MALL LIMITED PARTNERSHIP; ET AL. v. ARCH INSURANCE COMPANY, ET AL. M2016-01763-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Chancery Court Russell T. Perkins 10-1504-IV	Clement Jr., Frank G.: Reverse	Denied: Application of Opry Mills Mall Limited Partnership, & Simon Property Group, L.P., OPN of COA designated "Not For Citation" with Supreme Ct Rule 4(E) Order filed 5-17-18 (See Attached Order)

JOHN ANTHONY GENTRY v. KATHERINE WISE	Sumner County Circuit Court	Clement Jr., Frank G.: Affirm in Part	Denied: Application of John A.
GENTRY	Joe Thompson		Gentry
M2016-01765-SC-R11-CV	83CC1-2014-CV-393		Order filed 5-16-18
IN RE MICHAEL J. M2016-01985-SC-R11-JV	Rutherford County Juvenile Court Donna Scott Davenport 10726C	McBrayer, W. Neal: Affirm	Denied: Application of Michael J. Order filed 5-16-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. BRANDON	Davidson County Criminal Court	Thomas Jr., D. Kelly: Affirm	Denied: Application of Brandon
CHRISTOPHER SCOTT	Cheryl A. Blackburn		Christopher Scott
M2016-02362-SC-R11-CD	2015-B-1238		Order filed 5-16-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. JERICA ELIZABETH	Davidson County Criminal Court	Montgomery Jr., Robert H.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Jerica
TAYLOR	Cheryl A. Blackburn		Elizabeth Taylor
M2016-02578-SC-R11-CD	2015-B-937		Order filed 5-17-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. JEFFREY WAYNE	Lawrence County Circuit Court	Dyer, J. Ross: Affirm	Denied: Application of Jeffrey W.
HUGHES	Russell Parkes		Hughes
M2017-00057-SC-R11-CD	33792, 34049		Order filed 5-16-18

STATE OF TENNESSEE v. WILLIAM LAMONT	Davidson County Criminal Court	Per Curiam: Affirm	Denied: Application of William
GREEN	Cheryl A. Blackburn		Lamont Green
M2017-00734-SC-R11-CD	2007-B-1404		Order filed 5-16-18
BRIAN CASWELL MCGROWDER v. STATE OF	Davidson County Criminal Court	McMullen, Camille R.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Brian
TENNESSEE	Mark J. Fishburn		Caswell McGrowder
M2017-00751-SC-R11-PC	2012-B-1817		Order filed 5-16-18
COFFEE COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION v. CITY OF TULLAHOMA M2017-00935-SC-R11-CV	Coffee County Chancery Court Vanessa Jackson 2014-CV-179	Bennett, Andy D.: Reverse	Granted: Application of City of Tullahoma Order filed 5-17-18 (See Attached Order)
EDWARD RONNY ARNOLD v. BURNS PHILLIPS, COMMISSIONER TENNESSEE DEPARTMENT OF LABOR AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT M2017-01103-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Chancery Court Russell T. Perkins 16-1174-IV	Bennett, Andy D.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Edward Ronny Arnold Order filed 5-16-18

STATE OF TENNESSEE v. PERRY LEWIS SISCO M2017-01202-SC-R11-CD	Putnam County Criminal Court David A. Patterson 14-CR-843	Holloway Jr., Robert L.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Perry Lewis Sisco Order filed 5-17-18
GREGORY J. LAMMERT ET AL. v. AUTO- OWNERS (MUTUAL) INSURANCE COMPANY M2017-02546-SC-R23-CV	U.S. District Court, Middle District Waverly D. Crenshaw, Jr. 3-17-cv-00819		Accepted: Court accepts certification of question Order filed 5-16-18 (See Attached Order)
<u>Knoxville</u>			
BRADLEY COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM ET AL . v. THE CITY OF CLEVELAND, TENNESSEE E2016-01030-SC-R11-CV	Bradley County Chancery Court Jerri Bryant 2014-CV-84	Frierson II, Thomas R.: Affirm	Granted: Application of Bradley County, Tennessee, and Bradley County Board of Education Order filed 5-17-18(See Attached Order)
SULLIVAN COUNTY, TENNESSEE ET AL v. THE CITY OF BRISTOL, TENNESSEE, ET AL. E2016-02109-SC-R11-CV	Sullivan County (Blountville) Chancery Court John C. Rambo B0024737, K0039409	Frierson II, Thomas R.: Affirm	Granted: Application of Sullivan County Board of Education, and Sullivan County, Tennessee Order filed 5-17-18 (See Attached Order)

WASHINGTON COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM ET AL. v. THE CITY OF JOHNSON CITY TENNESSEE E2016-02583-SC-R11-CV	Washington County Chancery Court E. G. Moody 42491	Frierson II, Thomas R.: Reverse	Granted: Application of Washington County School System, Washington County Board of Education, and Washington County Order filed 5-17-18 (See Attached Order)
APRIL ELASTER v. GARY MASSEY JR., ET AL. E2017-00020-SC-R11-CV	Hamilton County Circuit Court Don R. Ash 15C877	Stafford, J. Steven: Affirm	Denied: Application of April Elaster Order filed 5-15-18
BLOUNT COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION ET AL. v. CITY OF MARYVILLE, TENNESSEE ET AL. E2017-00047-SC-R11-CV	Blount County Chancery Court Telford E. Forgety, Jr. 2014-053	Frierson II, Thomas R.: Affirm	Granted: Application of Blount County Board of Education, and Blount County, Tennessee Order filed 5-17-18 (See Attached Order)
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. ANDREW BERNARD BEVERLY E2017-00056-SC-R11-CD	Sevier County Circuit Court Paul G. Summers 20240	Dyer, J. Ross: Affirm	Denied: Application of Andrew Bernard Beverly Order filed 5-16-18

KEENAN SCOTT MCNEAL v. STATE OF	Blount County Circuit Court	Montgomery Jr., Robert H.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Keenan
TENNESSEE	David Reed Duggan		Scott McNeal
E2017-00281-SC-R11-PC	C-23753		Order filed 5-16-18
LINDA WIMMER v. CHATTANOOGA-HAMILTON COUNTY HOSPITAL AUTHORITY E2017-00352-SC-R11-CV	Hamilton County Circuit Court W. Neil Thomas, III 14C507	Swiney, D. Michael: Affirm McClarty, John W.: Dissent	Denied: Application of Linda Wimmer Order filed 5-16-18
IN RE AVA B E2017-00440-SC-R11-JV	Knox County Juvenile Court Timothy E. Irwin 112997	McClarty, John W.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Warren Beaves Order filed 5-17-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. EDWARD JEROME	Hamilton County Criminal Court	Dyer, J. Ross: Affirm	Denied: Application of Edward
HARBISON	Thomas C. Greenholtz		Jerome Harbison
E2017-00520-SC-R11-CD	154361, 154362		Order filed 5-15-18

STATE OF TENNESSEE v. HOWARD MELTON E2017-00613-SC-R11-CD	Knox County Criminal Court Bobby R. McGee 106607	Witt Jr., James Curwood: Affirm	Denied: Application of Howard Melton Order filed 5-15-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. AARON JERMAINE CLARK E2017-00616-SC-R11-CD	Hamilton County Criminal Court Thomas C. Greenholtz 275083, 294282, 294436, 294660, 294663	Holloway Jr., Robert L.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Aaron Jermaine Clark Order filed 5-17-18
DENNIS RASHEED GAYE v. STATE OF TENNESSEE E2017-00793-SC-R11-PC	Knox County Criminal Court Bobby R. McGee 104332	Montgomery Jr., Robert H.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Dennis R. Gaye Order filed 5-15-18
MICHAEL COBBLE ET AL. v. GREENE COUNTY, TENNESSEE ET AL. E2017-00896-SC-R11-CV	Greene County Chancery Court Douglas T. Jenkins 2014-0130	Swiney, D. Michael: Affirm in Part	Denied: Application of Greene County, Tennessee, and Green County Board of Zoning Appeals Order filed 5-16-18

JAMES ALLEN v. STATE OF TENNESSEE E2017-01043-SC-R11-PC	Washington County Criminal Court Lisa Rice 41230	Witt Jr., James Curwood: Affirm	Denied: Application of James Henry Allen Order filed 5-16-18
JOSE A. RIVAS v. RANDY LEE, WARDEN E2017-01597-SC-R11-HC	Johnson County Criminal Court Lisa Rice CC-17-CR-57	Witt Jr., James Curwood: Affirm	Denied: Application of Jose A. Riva Order filed 5-17-18
CAROLL JANE BYRD ET AL. v. HARVEY L. SPROUL ET AL. E2017-02182-SC-R11-CV	Loudon County Circuit Court Michael S. Pemberton 2012-CV-55	Per Curiam: Case Dispositional Decision	Denied: Application of Carroll Jane Byrd, and Estate of Charles Richard Grant Order filed 5-15-18
TRAVIS KANIPE as ADMINISTRATOR OF THE ESTATE OF SANDRA KANIPE v. PRAGNESH PATEL M.D., ET AL. E2017-02416-SC-R11-CV	Hamblen County Circuit Court Thomas J. Wright 14-CV-061	Per Curiam: Case Dispositional Decision	Denied: Application of Pragnesh Patel, and Morristown Heart Consultants, PLLC Order filed 5-15-18

<u>Jackson</u>

CURTIS KELLER v. STATE OF TENNESSEE W2016-00416-SC-R11-PC	Shelby County Criminal Court James M. Lammey 10-07532	Woodall, Thomas T.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Curtis Keller Order filed 5-18-18
LATISHA JONES v. STATE OF TENNESSEE W2016-01697-SC-R11-HC	Shelby County Criminal Court Glenn Ivy Wright 04-02523	Thomas Jr., D. Kelly: Affirm	Denied: Application of Latisha Jones Order filed 5-17-18
JEFFREY HENRY v. STATE OF TENNESSEE W2016-01821-SC-R11-PC	Shelby County Criminal Court John Wheeler Campbell 13-06323, 13-06324	Woodall, Thomas T.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Jeffrey Henry Order filed 5-17-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. TREVIAL MOSS W2016-01973-SC-R11-CD	Shelby County Criminal Court W. Mark Ward 14-06090	McMullen, Camille R.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Trevial Moss Order filed 5-17-18
DERMON-WARNER PROPERTIES LLC v. STEVE H. WARNER W2016-02051-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Chancery Court Jim Kyle CH-12-0976	Bennett, Andy D.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Steve H. Warner Order filed 5-18-18

STATE OF TENNESSEE v. JAQUAN GATHING	Shelby County Criminal Court	Williams, John Everett: Affirm	Denied: Application of Jaquan
and PRINCE PARKER	James C. Beasley, Jr.		Gathing
W2016-02076-SC-R11-CD	14-03635		Order filed 5-17-18
JOSEPH CORDELL BREWER, III v. STATE OF	Obion County Circuit Court	Woodall, Thomas T.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Joseph
TENNESSEE	Jeff Parham		Cordell Brewer, III
W2016-02106-SC-R11-PC	CC-16-CR-49		Order filed 5-17-18
BENJAMIN RUNYON v. LISA ZACHARIAS W2016-02141-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Robert L. Childers CT-005120-15	Clement Jr., Frank G.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Benjamin Runyon Order filed 5-17-18
JEFFREY HENRY v. STATE OF TENNESSEE W2016-02435-SC-R11-ECN	Shelby County Criminal Court John Wheeler Campbell 13-06323, 13-06324	Glenn, Alan E.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Jeffrey Henry Order filed 5-17-18

DAVID IVY v. STATE OF TENNESSEE W2016-02454-SC-R11-ECN	Shelby County Criminal Court James C. Beasley, Jr. 01-12388	Ogle, Norma McGee: Affirm	Denied: Application of David Ivy Order filed 5-18-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. KEVIN TURNER W2016-02599-SC-R11-CD	Shelby County Criminal Court Carolyn W. Blackett 15-01136	Glenn, Alan E.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Kevin Turner Order filed 5-18-18
STATE OF TENNESSEE v. CORBYN DAVIS W2017-00141-SC-R11-CD	Madison County Circuit Court Donald H. Allen 16-204	Williams, John Everett: Affirm	Denied: Application of Corbyn Davis Order filed 5-18-18
WELLS FARGO BANK NA v. MARCUS DORRIS W2017-00617-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Rhynette N. Hurd CT-002902-16	Stafford, J. Steven: Reverse in Part	Denied: Application of Marcus Dorris Order filed 5-17-18
JULIA PUTNAM ET AL. v. JOHN W. LEACH ADMINISTRATOR AD LITEM OF THE ESTATE OF BRYANE R. LITSINBERGER W2017-00728-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Mary L. Wagner CT-000415-16	Goldin, Arnold B.: Affirm	Denied: Application of Julia Putnam and Charles Putnam Order filed 5-17-18

Tennessee Claims Commission Commissioner, TN. Claims Commission (Western Division)	Stafford, J. Steven: Affirm	Denied: Application of Jannie Mildred Lynn and Shelley Renae Lynn
T20140890		Order filed 5-17-18
	Commissioner, TN. Claims Commission (Western Division)	Commissioner, TN. Claims Commission (Western Division)

CINDY HATFIELD, ET AL. v. ALLENBROOKE NURSING AND REHABILITATION CENTER, LLC, ET AL. W2018-00314-SC-R10-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Mary L. Wagner	Per Curiam: Case Dispositional Decision	Denied: Application of Cindy Hatfield
	CT-004249-10		Order filed 5-17-18

BLOUNT COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION ET AL. v. CITY OF MARYVILLE, TENNESSEE ET AL.

Chancery Court for Blount County No. 2014-053

No. E2017-00047-SC-R11-CV

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of Blount County Board of Education, and Blount County, Tennessee and the record before us, the application is granted.

Upon the completion of briefing, the Clerk is directed to place this matter on the docket for oral argument with the following cases: *Coffee County Board of Education v. City of Tullahoma*, No. M2017-00935-SC-R11-CV; *Washington County School System, et al. v. The City of Johnson City Tennessee*, No. E2016-02583-SC-R11-CV; *Sullivan County, Tennessee, et al., v. The City of Bristol, Tennessee, et al.*, No. E2016-02109-SC-R11-CV; and *Bradley County School System, et al. v. The City of Cleveland, Tennessee*, No. E2016-01030-SC-R11-CV. Although the cases share similar issues, they are consolidated only for purposes of oral argument. During the consolidated argument, each side (the plaintiffs collectively and the defendants collectively) shall receive one hour of argument time, for a total of two hours of argument for all five appeals. Each side shall determine how to allocate the argument time between the parties. For purposes of oral argument, the plaintiffs shall collectively proceed as the appellents, and the defendants shall collectively proceed as the appellees.

BRADLEY COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM ET AL . v. THE CITY OF CLEVELAND, TENNESSEE

Chancery Court for Bradley County No. 2014-CV-84

No. E2016-01030-SC-R11-CV

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of Bradley County, Tennessee, and Bradley County Board of Education and the record before us, the application is granted.

Upon the completion of briefing, the Clerk is directed to place this matter on the docket for oral argument with the following cases: *Coffee County Board of Education v. City of Tullahoma*, No. M2017-00935-SC-R11-CV; *Washington County School System, et al. v. The City of Johnson City Tennessee*, No. E2016-02583-SC-R11-CV; *Sullivan County, Tennessee, et al., v. The City of Bristol, Tennessee, et al.*, No. E2016-02109-SC-R11-CV; and *Blount County Board of Education, et al. v. City of Maryville, Tennessee, et al.*, No. E2017-00047-SC-R11-CV. Although the cases share similar issues, they are consolidated only for purposes of oral argument. During the consolidated argument, each side (the plaintiffs collectively and the defendants collectively) shall receive one hour of argument time, for a total of two hours of argument for all five appeals. Each side shall determine how to allocate the argument time between the parties. For purposes of oral argument, the plaintiffs shall collectively proceed as the appellants, and the defendants shall collectively proceed as the appellees.

COFFEE COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION v. CITY OF TULLAHOMA

Chancery Court for Coffee County No. 2014-CV-179

No. M2017-00935-SC-R11-CV

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of City of Tullahoma and the record before us, the application is granted.

Upon the completion of briefing, the Clerk is directed to place this matter on the docket for oral argument with the following cases: *Washington County School System, et al. v. The City of Johnson City Tennessee*, No. E2016-02583-SC-R11-CV; *Sullivan County, Tennessee, et al., v. The City of Bristol, Tennessee, et al.,* No. E2016-02109-SC-R11-CV; *Bradley County School System, et al. v. The City of Cleveland, Tennessee*, No. E2016-01030-SC-R11-CV; and *Blount County Board of Education, et al. v. City of Maryville, Tennessee, et al.,* No. E2017-00047-SC-R11-CV. Although the cases share similar issues, they are consolidated only for purposes of oral argument. During the consolidated argument, each side (the plaintiffs collectively and the defendants collectively) shall receive one hour of argument time, for a total of two hours of argument for all five appeals. Each side shall determine how to allocate the argument time between the parties. For purposes of oral argument, the plaintiffs shall collectively proceed as the appellants, and the defendants shall collectively proceed as the appelles. For purposes of briefing, the City of Tullahoma shall proceed as the appellent and the Coffee County Board of Education shall proceed as the appellee.

GREGORY J. LAMMERT ET AL. V. AUTO-OWNERS (MUTUAL) INSURANCE COMPANY

Rule 23 Certified Question of Law from the United States District Court for the Middle District of Tennessee

No. 3-17-cv-00819

No. M2017-02546-SC-R23-CV

ORDER

Pursuant to Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 23, a certification order was filed in this Court on December 28, 2017, by the United States District Court for the Middle District of Tennessee. Briefs have now been filed pursuant to Section 7, and, upon consideration of the certification order and the briefs filed by the parties, this Court accepts certification of the following question of law:

Under Tennessee law, may an insurer in making an actual cash value payment withhold a portion of repair labor as depreciation when the policy (1) defines actual cash value as "the cost to replace damaged property with new property of similar quality and features reduced by the amount of depreciation applicable to the damaged property immediately prior to the loss," or (2) states that "actual cash value includes a deduction for depreciation"?

Pursuant to Rule 23, Section 7(B) of the Supreme Court Rules, this Court desires to have oral argument by the parties. This case shall be set for hearing at the Court's October 2018 session in Nashville.

OPRY MILLS MALL LIMITED PARTNERSHIP; ET AL. v. ARCH INSURANCE COMPANY, ET AL.

Chancery Court for Davidson County No. 10-1504-IV

No. M2016-01763-SC-R11-CV

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of Opry Mills Mall Limited Partnership, and Simon Property Group, L.P. and the record before us, the application is denied.

The opinion of the Court of Appeals is designated "Not For Citation" in accordance with Supreme Court Rule 4, § E.

SULLIVAN COUNTY, TENNESSEE, ET AL. v. THE CITY OF BRISTOL, TENNESSEE, ET AL.

Chancery Court for Sullivan County No. B0024737, K0039409

No. E2016-02109-SC-R11-CV

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of Sullivan County Board of Education, and Sullivan County, Tennessee and the record before us, the application is granted.

Upon the completion of briefing, the Clerk is directed to place this matter on the docket for oral argument with the following cases: *Coffee County Board of Education v. City of Tullahoma*, No. M2017-00935-SC-R11-CV; *Washington County School System, et al. v. The City of Johnson City Tennessee*, No. E2016-02583-SC-R11-CV; *Bradley County School System, et al. v. The City of Cleveland, Tennessee*, No. E2016-01030-SC-R11-CV; and *Blount County Board of Education, et al. v. City of Maryville, Tennessee, et al.*, No. E2017-00047-SC-R11-CV. Although the cases share similar issues, they are consolidated only for purposes of oral argument. During the consolidated argument, each side (the plaintiffs collectively and the defendants collectively) shall receive one hour of argument time, for a total of two hours of argument for all five appeals. Each side shall determine how to allocate the argument time between the parties. For purposes of oral argument, the plaintiffs shall collectively proceed as the appellants, and the defendants shall collectively proceed as the appellees.

WASHINGTON COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM ET AL. v. THE CITY OF JOHNSON CITY TENNESSEE

Chancery Court for Washington County No. 42491

No. E2016-02583-SC-R11-CV

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of Washington County School System, Washington County Board of Education, and Washington County and the record before us, the application is granted.

Upon the completion of briefing, the Clerk is directed to place this matter on the docket for oral argument with the following cases: *Coffee County Board of Education v. City of Tullahoma*, No. M2017-00935-SC-R11-CV; *Sullivan County, Tennessee, et al., v. The City of Bristol, Tennessee, et al.*, No. E2016-02109-SC-R11-CV; *Bradley County School System, et al. v. The City of Cleveland, Tennessee*, No. E2016-01030-SC-R11-CV; and *Blount County Board of Education, et al. v. City of Maryville, Tennessee, et al.*, No. E2017-00047-SC-R11-CV. Although the cases share similar issues, they are consolidated only for purposes of oral argument. During the consolidated argument, each side (the plaintiffs collectively and the defendants collectively) shall receive one hour of argument time, for a total of two hours of argument for all five appeals. Each side shall determine how to allocate the argument time between the parties. For purposes of oral argument, the plaintiffs shall collectively proceed as the appellents, and the defendants shall collectively proceed as the appellees.