IN THE SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE AT NASHVILLE

)

STATE OF TENNESSEE

VS.

PERVIS T. PAYNE

No. M1988-00096-SC-DPE-DD

SUPPLEMENT TO MOTION TO VACATE EXECUTION DATE

Pervis Payne has requested that this Court vacate a pending December 12, 2007 execution date given the United States District Court's ruling in <u>Harbison v. Little</u>, M.D.Tenn. No. 3:06-1206, R. 147 (Sept. 19, 2007) as well as the grant of certiorari in <u>Baze v. Rees</u>, U.S.No. 07-5439. Since Pervis Payne filed his motion, there have been at least two intervening events which further support the vacating of the execution date:

1. In Texas, Carlton Turner challenged Texas' lethal injection protocol, which (like Tennessee's) uses the same three drugs used by Kentucky in <u>Baze</u>. In the United States Supreme Court, Turner sought a stay of execution pending the disposition of <u>Baze</u>. On September 27, 2007, the Supreme Court granted that stay of execution, which remains in effect until the Court disposes of Turner's petition for writ of certiorari, which will almost certainly occur after <u>Baze</u> is decided. Turner v. Texas, 551 U.S. (2007)(Exhibit 1).

2. In addition, on October 2, 2007, the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals granted a similar lethal injection stay in <u>Ex Parte Heliberto Chi</u>, No. WR-61,600-02 (Tex.Cr.App. Oct. 2, 2007)(Attached as Exhibit 2). <u>See also Condemned Killer Wins Reprieve On Lethal Injection Claim</u>, Associated Press, Oct. 3, 2007 (Attached as Exhibit 3)(discussing stay of execution in Chi case).

3. Given this Court's order in <u>Harbison</u>, the United States Supreme Court's stay in

Turner, and the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals' stay in Chi, this Court should vacate Pervis

Payne's execution until <u>Baze</u> and/or <u>Harbison</u> are decided by the federal courts.

CONCLUSION

The motion to vacate the execution date should be granted.

Respectfully submitted,

J. Brook Lathram (BPR No. 4808) Les Jones (BPR No. 13290) Todd Rose (BPR No. 15012) BURCH, PORTER, AND JOHNSON, PLLC 130 North Court Avenue Memphis, Tennessee 38103 (901) 524-5000

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on October 3, 2007, a copy of the foregoing was sent via first-class mail to Joseph F. Whalen, 425 Fifth Avenue North, Nashville, Tennessee 37243.

mit Jathier J. Brook Lathram

Exhibit 1 Turner v. Texas, 551 U.S. ___ (Sept. 27, 2007)

(ORDER LIST: 551 U.S.)

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 27, 2007

ORDER IN PENDING CASE

07A272 TURNER, CARLTON A. V. TEXAS

The application for stay of execution of sentence of death presented to Justice Scalia and by him referred to the Court is granted pending the timely filing and disposition of a petition for a writ of certiorari. Should the petition for a writ of certiorari be denied, this stay shall terminate automatically. In the event the petition for a writ of certiorari is granted, the stay shall terminate upon the issuance of the mandate of this Court.

Exhibit 2

Ex Parte Heliberto Chi, No. WR-61,600-2 (Tex.Cr.App. Oct. 2, 2007)









rts Online | A-Z Index Best Viewed 1024x768+

urthouse photos courtesy of texascourthouses.com.

Search

exas Courts Online

Case # WR-61,600-02 -> Event: MOT STAY EXEC

MOT STAY EXEC DISP

10/2/2007

Opinions Related to this Event:

GRANT/ORIGSE

C Hint: Click On The Folder Icons Above For More Case

No Description Available.

Judicial Directory

Judicial Information

CaseMail

General Information

CCA Home

Practice Before the Court Rules & Procedures | Forms | Issues | Oral Argument Instructions | Opinion Archives | Hand Down Archives

Links

- **About the Court** Contact | Judges | Employment | Overview Virtual Tour
- Search Courts Site

Type Search Word

Case Information

- Hand Down List (Orders, Opinions & Statements)
- Case Search
- **Opinion Search**
- Case Submissions

Case Mail

Track Cases or Released Opinions My Account | Case Tracking | Opinion Tracking | Register | Basics | FAQs

Texas Appellate Courts

- The Supreme Court of Texas
- Court of Criminal Appeals
- Courts of Appeals [District-City] 1-Houston | 2-Fort Worth | 3-Austin 4-San Antonio | 5-Dallas | 6-Texarkana 7-Amarillo | 8-El Paso | 9-Beaumont 10-Waco | 11-Eastland | 12-Tyler 13-Corpus Christi | 14-Houston
- Appellate Statistics



Court of Criminal of Appeals • Supreme Court Building • 201 West 14th, Room 106 • Austin, Texas 78701 • Telephone: (512) 463-1551 • Email Court

Accessibility Policy | Privacy & Security Policy | Open Records Policy | State Web Site Link & Privacy Policy | Email Webmaster Texas Online | Trail - Statewide Search | Texas Homeland Security | Whene the Meney Goes (State Expenditures)

DISP

Event Type:

Description:

Disposition:

Opinion Written:

No records returned.

Information.

Date Issued

Date:

Event Information:

Case Search Results on Case # WR-61,600-02

Case Information:

Case Number:	WR-61,600-02
Date Filed:	10/2/2007
Case Type:	11.071
Style:	CHI, HELIBERTO
v.:	

Case Events:

	Date	Event Type	Description
Ť	10/2/2007	11.071 WRIT RECD	Art. 11.071 - Application For Counsel
Ô	10/2/2007	WRIT SUBMITTED	Art. 11.071 - Application For Counsel
Û	10/2/2007	MOT STAY EXEC RECD	No Description Available.
\mathfrak{S}	10/2/2007	MOT STAY EXEC DISP	No Description Available.
		an a	

Calendars:

	Set Date	Calendar Type	Reason Set
3	10/2/2007	PENDNG	SUBMITTED
Ô	10/2/2007	HOLD	TC/ANSWER
		and a second second	

Parties:

	Party	Party Type		
Û	CHI, HELIBERTO	Applicant (Writs)/Appellant		

Court of Appeals Case Information:

COA Case Number: COA Disposition: Opinion Cite: Court of Appeals District:

Trial Court Information:

Trial Court: County: Case Number: Judge: Court Reporter:

CaseMail

Exhibit 3

Condemned Killer Wins Reprieve On Lethal Injection Claim Associated Press, October 3, 2007

.

Switch Client Preferences Live Support Sign Off

Dossier History

LexisNexis" Total Research System

Search Research Tasks Get a Document Shepard's® Alerts

Source: <u>Command Searching > News</u>, All (English, Full Text) Terms: heliberto w/10 chi (Edit Search | Suggest Terms for My Search)

✓Select for FOCUS[™] or Delivery

Condemned killer wins reprieve on lethal injection claim The Associated Press State & Local Wire October 3, 2007 Wednesday 7:04 AM GMT

> Copyright 2007 Associated Press All Rights Reserved The Associated Press State & Local Wire

October 3, 2007 Wednesday 7:04 AM GMT

SECTION: STATE AND REGIONAL

LENGTH: 851 words

HEADLINE: Condemned killer wins reprieve on lethal injection claim

BYLINE: By MICHAEL GRACZYK, Associated Press Writer

DATELINE: HOUSTON

BODY:

The Texas Court of Criminal Appeals brought the state in line with the effect of a U.S. Supreme Court review of lethal injection procedures by stopping Wednesday's scheduled execution of a Honduran man.

In a reversal from a week ago, the state's highest criminal court Tuesday ordered a halt to the lethal injection of **Heliberto Chi**, 28, condemned for killing the manager of an Arlington clothing store during a robbery 6 1/2 years ago.

Just last week, the appeals court was given a similar appeal for Carlton Turner Jr., a Dallas man set to die for killing his parents, but refused to stop his punishment. The Supreme Court, which last week agreed to review whether lethal injection is unconstitutionally cruel in a claim raised by two condemned Kentucky inmates, gave Turner a reprieve a few hours later, sparing him a trip to the nation's busiest death chamber in Huntsville.

The Kentucky lethal injection procedure is the same one used by Texas and other states.

Although Chi's lawyers were prepared to go to the Supreme Court, his appeal never got that far.

"I'm grateful there's some measure of common sense descending on the great state of Texas," Wes Ball, Chi's attorney, said. "We're not left in the wilderness."

Chi would have been the 27th inmate executed in Texas this year, far more than any other state.

"We're actually joining the company of perhaps more progressive states like Alabama and Florida," Ball said. "Somebody's finally going to decide this question, so let's stop killing people. If we're supposed to kill them, we can kill them later." In its brief order, the appeals court gave state lawyers 30 days to address the question of "whether the current method of administering lethal injection in Texas constitutes cruel and unusual punishment" in violation of the Eighth Amendment of the Constitution.

In their appeal, Chi's attorneys said the execution procedure "creates a wholly unnecessary, unacceptable risk that he will experience excruciating pain and suffering."

The Texas Attorney General's Office has said it will review each condemned inmate with an approaching execution date on a case-by-case basis. Gov. Rick Perry, who could issue a 30-day reprieve, has said through a spokesman that the matter is for the courts to resolve but also has said he believes the procedure is proper.

Early last week, within hours of the Supreme Court announcement in the Kentucky case, the courts allowed Texas officials to execute Michael Richard for a slaying 21 years ago. Lawyers attributed his execution moving forward to procedural hurdles they couldn't overcome in the hours immediately after the high court announced its Kentucky review. The Texas Court of Criminal Appeals never ruled in his case because the appeal was filed past the court's 5 p.m. closing time.

In Turner's case, the Texas court voted 5-4 against stopping his punishment. The order in Chi's reprieve listed no dissenters among the judges.

Attorneys involved in death penalty litigation viewed Chi's case as a better indicator of the immediate future of lethal injection in Texas, where 405 inmates have received the toxic drug combinaton since the state resumed capital punishment in 1982.

Earlier Tuesday, Terence O'Rourke, a lawyer in the Chi case working with the government of Honduras, lost a request to the Texas Board of Pardons and Paroles for a commutation request or 180-day reprieve.

O'Rourke's focus was on Chi's inability to contact someone from the Honduran government, a violation of an international treaty, after he was arrested for the 2001 slaying of Armand Paliotta.

The board voted Tuesday 7-0 against a request for commutation. The request for a 180-day reprieve failed in a 4-3 vote.

The International Court of Justice in The Hague, ruling in a suit Mexico filed against the United States, has said the convictions of about 50 Mexican-born prisoners violated the 1963 Vienna Convention because they were denied legal help available under the treaty. President Bush then ordered new state court hearings for those prisoners based on the ruling, but his order applies only to imprisoned Mexican citizens.

David Dow, a University of Houston law professor involved in the Turner and Chi appeals, said Chi was "getting executed because he's Honduran rather than Mexican."

"That seems absurd," he said.

Chi was in the United States illegally when he was arrested in California, then extradited to Texas to face the capital murder charges.

Chi, who once worked as a tailor at the store where the shooting occured, would say little about the crime in an interview last week.

"My situation is not about being innocent or guilty," he told The Associated Press. "My rights were violated.

"I'm a Christian. I know about the Lord. If it's the Lord's will, things happen. I have great peace in my mind and soul."

The next scheduled execution isn't until late November. It's one of at least three lethal injections on

the Texas Department of Criminal Justice execution calendar extending into next year.

On the Net:

Texas Department of Criminal Justice execution schedule http://www.tdcj.state.tx.us/stat/scheduledexecutions.htm

LOAD-DATE: October 3, 2007

Source: Command Searching > News, All (English, Full Text) Terms: heliberto w/10 chi (Edit Search | Suggest Terms for My Search) View: Fuli Date/Time: Wednesday, October 3, 2007 - 10:00 AM EDT

> Search | Research Tasks | Get a Document | Shepard's® | Alerts History | Delivery Manager | Dossier | Switch Client | Preferences | Sign Off | Help



About LexisNexis | Terms & Conditions | Contact Us LexisNexis Copyright © 2007 LexisNexis, a division of Reed Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

÷.