

FILED	
APR 1 7 2020	
Clerk of the Appellate Courts Rec'd By	
ADM 2020.00	5((

STATE OF TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Mailing Address: P.O.Box 159036 Nashville, TN 37215

MEMBERS OF THE TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Dee David Gay Board Chair

Andrew G. Brigham Vice Chair

Marshall L. Davidson, III Disciplinary Counsel

Shane Hutton Assistant Disciplinary Counsel

Jeffrey M. Atherton H. Allen Bray Robert Carter, Jr. Edwena L. Crowe Rita Ellison William C. Koch, Jr. Camille R. McMullen Albert Mosley Benjamin Purser, Jr. Richard Rogers Dan Springer Terica Smith John Whitworth Robert W. Wilkinson April 17, 2020

Judiciary Committee of the Senate Senator Mike Bell 716 Cordell Hull Building Nashville, TN 37243

Dear Senator Bell:

Please find enclosed the Quarterly Report of the Board of Judicial Conduct covering the period of January 1, 2020 through March 31, 2020 for the Fiscal Year 2019-2020, as mandated by Tenn. Code Ann. § 17-5-207.



DDG/sp Enclosure James M, Hivner, Clerk 401 Seventh Avenue, North Nashville, TN 37219-1407 615-253-1470



FILED APR 1 7 2020 Clerk of the Appellate Courts Rec'd By ADM2020-00010

STATE OF TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Mailing Address: P.O.Box 159036 Nashville, TN 37215

MEMBERS OF THE TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Dee David Gay Board Chair

Andrew G. Brigham Vice Chair

Marshall L. Davidson, III Disciplinary Counsel

Shane Hutton Assistant Disciplinary Counsel

Jeffrey M, Atherton H, Allen Bray Robert Carter, Jr. Edwena L, Crowe Rita Ellison William C, Koch, Jr. Camille R, McMullen Albert Mosley Benjamin Purser, Jr. Richard Rogers Dan Springer Terica Smith John Whitworth Robert W, Wilkinson April 17, 2020

Judiciary Committee of the House Representative Michael Curcio 630 Cordell Hull Building Nashville, TN 37243

Dear Representative Curcio:

Please find enclosed the Quarterly Report of the Board of Judicial Conduct covering the period of January 1, 2020 through March 31, 2020 for the Fiscal Year 2019-2020, as mandated by Tenn. Code Ann. § 17-5-207.

Board Chair

DDG/sp Enclosure James M. Hivner, Clerk 401 Seventh Avenue, North Nashville, TN 37219-1407 015-253-1470

BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT QUARTERLY REPORT (For the period 1/1/2020 through 3/31/2020) Due 4/20/2020

FILED	
APR 1 7 2020	
Clerk of the Appellate Courts Rec'd By	
ADM 2020-00	

The number of complaints OPENED¹ this quarter is 125. Year to date the number is 125.

The number of complaints CLOSED this quarter is 119. Year to date the number is 119^2 .

The DISPOSITION of the complaints closed this quarter is:

	YTD (Year to Date)
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling 59	59
Dismissed, no jurisdiction 6	6
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis 39	39
Dismissal with warning 3	3
Dismissal after full investigation 0	0
Deferred discipline agreement 0	0
Private reprimand 1	1
Public reprimand 0	0
Other 11	11
Retired complaint, no longer a judge0	0
Cease and Desist Order 0	0
Suspension 0	0
Recommendation of removal from office 0	0
TOTAL 119	119

The number of complaints PENDING on the last day of this quarter is 13.

The number of complaints for which PROBABLE CAUSE WAS FOUND³ this guarter is 2.

^{1.} A single complaint naming several judges is counted as a separate complaint against each judge. A complaint whose allegations encompass more than one category is listed under the most serious category alleged. This Board came into existence on July 1, 2019. Therefore, there is no five-year statistical data to compare. On March 13, 2020, the Tennessee Supreme Court declared a state of Emergency for the Judicial Branch of Tennessee government and suspended in-person court proceedings, with certain exceptions through March 31, 2020. See In re: Covid-19 Pandemic, No. ADM2020-00428 (Tenn. 2020). On March 25, 2020, the Tennessee Supreme Court continued the suspension of in-court proceedings through April 30, 2020. Id.

^{2.} This category represents complaints were closed after July 1, 2019, but were at various stages of investigation by the previous Board of Judicial Conduct.

^{3.&}quot;Probable cause was found" means that Disciplinary Counsel and the investigative panel believe that there is evidence supporting the allegations against a judge and the investigative panel has authorized a full investigation pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 17-5-303 (c)(2).

The number year to date is 2.

The number of complaints for which FORMAL CHARGES WERE FILED this quarter is 0. The number year to date is 0.

The NATURE of the complaints filed and the TYPE OF JUDGE according to the following categories is:

A) Failure to comply with t	he law:	YTD
Criminal	26	26
Circuit	19	19
Chancery	3	3
General Sessions	16	16
Juvenile	4	4
Magistrate and Referee	2	2
Municipal	0	0
Commissioner	1	1
Probate	2	2
Appellate Court	0	0
Senior and Retired	3	3
Other	4	<u>4</u> (Non-judge, deceased judge, judge from another
TOTAL	80	80 state, etc.)
B) Bias, prejudice and unfa Criminal Circuit	i rness: 11 7	<u>YTD</u> 11 7
Criminal Circuit Chancery	irness: 11 7 0	<u>YTD</u> 11 7 0
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions	11 7	<u>YTD</u> 11 7 0 4
Criminal Circuit Chancery	11 7 0	<u>YTD</u> 11 7 0 4 1
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions	11 7 0	<u>YTD</u> 11 7 0 4 1 0
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions Juvenile	11 7 0 4 1	<u>YTD</u> 11 7 0 4 1 0 0
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions Juvenile Magistrate and Referee	11 7 0 4 1 0	YTD 11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions Juvenile Magistrate and Referee Municipal	11 7 0 4 1 0 0	<u>YTD</u> 11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0 0
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions Juvenile Magistrate and Referee Municipal Commissioner Probate Appellate Court	11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0	YTD 11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0 0 0
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions Juvenile Magistrate and Referee Municipal Commissioner Probate	11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0 0	YTD 11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 1
Criminal Circuit Chancery General Sessions Juvenile Magistrate and Referee Municipal Commissioner Probate Appellate Court	11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0 0	<u>YTD</u> 11 7 0 4 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 2

C) Discourtesy:		YTD
Criminal	0	0
Circuit	1	1
Chancery	=	0
General Sessions		2
Juvenile	0	0
	-	0
Magistrate and Referee		-
Municipal	-	0
Commissioner		0
Probate	-	0
Appellate Court		0
Senior and Retired		0
Other	1	
TOTAL	4	5
D) Abuse of office:		YTD
Criminal	0	0
Circuit	2	2
Chancery		Ō
General Sessions		1
Juvenile	•	Ō
Magistrate and Referee	-	ŏ
Municipal		ŏ
Commissioner		Õ
Probate	õ	0 0
Appellate Court	-	Õ
Senior and Retired		õ
Other	Õ	0
TOTAL	3	3
	-	•
E) Delay:		<u>YTD</u>
Criminal	3	3
Circuit	0	0
Chancery	0	0
General Sessions	1	1
Juvenile	0	0
Magistrate and Referee	0	0
Municipal	0	0
Commissioner	0	Ō
Probate	0	Ō
Appellate Court	0	0
Senior and Retired	0	Ó
Other	2	2
TOTAL	6	6

F) Ex parte communication	IS:	<u>YTD</u>
Criminal	0	0
Circuit	0	0
Chancery	0	0
General Sessions	0	0
Juvenile	0	0
Magistrate and Referee	0	0
Municipal	0	0
Commissioner	0	0
Probate	0	0
Appellate Court	0	0
Senior and Retired	0	0
Other	0	0
TOTAL	0	0

G) Disability:		YTD
Criminal	0	0
Circuit	0	0
Chancery	2	2
General Sessions	0	0
Juvenile	0	0
Magistrate and Referee	0	0
Municipal	0	0
Commissioner	0	0
Probate	0	0
Appellate Court	0	0
Senior and Retired	0	0
Other	0	0
TOTAL	2	2

H) Political violation:		YTD
Criminal	0	0
Circuit	0	0
Chancery	0	0
General Sessions	0	0
Juvenile	0	0
Magistrate and Referee	0	0
Municipal	0	0
Commissioner	0	0
Probate	0	0
Appellate Court	0	0
Senior and Retired	0	0
Other	_0_	0
TOTAL	0	0

I) Recusal:		<u>YTD</u>
Criminal	ł	1
Circuit	1	1
Chancery	0	0
General Sessions	0	0
Juvenile	0	0
Magistrate and Referee	0	0
Municipal	0	0
Commissioner	0	0
Probate	0	0
Appellate Court	0	0
Senior and Retired	0	0
Other	0	0
TOTAL	2	2

J) Miscellaneous:		<u>YTD</u>
Criminal	0	0
Circuit	1	1
Chancery	0	0
General Sessions	0	0
Juvenile	0	0
Magistrate and Referee	1	1
Municipal	0	0
Commissioner	0	0
Probate	0	0
Appellate Court	0	0
Senior and Retired	0	0
Other	0	0
TOTAL	2	2

Member Voting

	D	FI	D(YTD)	FI(YTD)
Hon. Jeffrey Atherton	26	0	26	0
Hon. H. Allen Bray	24	1	24	1
Hon. Andrew Brigham	21	0	21	0
Hon. Robert Carter Jr	24	1	24	1
Edwena Crowe	24	1	24	1
Rita Ellison	26	0	26	0
William Koch Jr	15	0	15	0
Hon. Camille McMullen	24	1	24	1
Dr. Albert Mosley	21	0	21	0
Benjamin Purser Jr	15	0	15	0
Richard Rogers	21	0	21	0
Dan Springer	15	0	15	0
Terica Smith	24	1	24	1
Hon. John Whitworth	24	1	24	1
Robert Wilkinson	26	0	26	0

D= Dismissals

FI= Full Investigations

Respectfully submitted,

.

Dee David Gay, Board Chair BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT



STATE OF TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Mailing Address: P.O.Box 159036 Nashville, TN 37215

MEMBERS OF THE TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Dee David Gay Board Chair

Andrew G. Brigham Vice Chair

Marshall L. Davidson, III Disciplinary Counsel

Shane Hutton Assistant Disciplinary Counsel

Jeffrey M. Atherton H. Allen Bray Robert Carter, Jr. Edwena L. Crowe Rita Ellison William C. Koch, Jr. Camille R. McMullen Albert Mosley Benjamin Purser, Jr. Richard Rogers Dan Springer Terica Smith John Whitworth Robert W. Wilkinson James M. Flivner, Clerk 401 Seventh Avenue, North Nashville, TN 37219-1407 615-253-1470

April 17, 2020

Judiciary Committee of the House Representative Michael Curcio 630 Cordell Hull Building Nashville, TN 37243

Dear Representative Curcio:

Please find enclosed the statistical report of the Board of Judicial Conduct covering filings and dispositions for the month of March, 2020, as mandated by Tenn. Code Ann. § 17-5-202.

If you have any questions or concerns, please contact me.



DDG/sp Enclosure