## SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE SUPREME COURT DISCRETIONARY APPEALS May 6, 2002 AMENDED MAY 9, 2002

| STYLE/APPEAL NUMBER  | COUNTY<br>TRIAL JUDGE<br>TRIAL COURT NO.                    | APPELLATE<br>JUDGE<br>JUDGMENT  | NATURE<br>OF APPEAL | ACTION  |
|--|---|---|---------------------|---|
| Jeffrey A. Simmons<br>v.<br>Gath Baptist Church, et al.<br>M2001-02511-SC-R11-CV                     | Warren Circuit<br>Charles D. Haston, Sr.<br>909             | Cain, J.  | Rule 11             | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Jeffrey A. Simmons.  |
| Guy Wilson, et ux.<br>v.<br>Thompson Construction Company,<br>et al.<br>M2000-03200-SC-R11-CV        | Sumner Circuit<br>C.L. Rogers<br>20134-C                    | Cain, J.<br>Affirmed.   | Rule 11             | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Guy and Rhessa Wilson.   |
| Alexander Wells<br>v.<br>State of Tennessee<br>M2001-00144-SC-R11-CV                                 | Tennessee Claims<br>Commission<br>William Baker<br>98000548 | Cantrell, J.<br>Affirmed.   | Rule 11             | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Alexander Wells.   |
| Williamson County, et al.<br>v.<br>Tennessee State Board of<br>Equalization<br>M2000-03178-SC-R11-CV | Davidson Chancery<br>Ellen H. Lyle<br>00-522-III            | Cain, J.<br>Affirmed.   | Rule 11             | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Shelby County,<br>TN., Williamson County, TN.,<br>Tennessee County Governments,<br>Tennessee City Governments,<br>Metropolitan Government of Nashville<br>and Davidson County. |
| Donald Joseph Russo<br>v.<br>Debra Ann Russo<br>M1999-02380-SC-R11-CV                                | Sumner Chancery<br>Tom E. Gray<br>98D-355                   | Highers, J.<br>Crawford, J.<br>Cain, J.<br>Affirmed in Part,<br>Reversed in Part. | Rule 11             | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Debra Ann<br>Russo.  |

| Anthony D. Myers, et al.<br>v.<br>W. Allen Bryan, III. et al.<br>M2000-03188-SC-R11-CV                                  | Williamson Chancery<br>Russ Heldman<br>1-25483          | Susano, J.<br>Affirmed, Case<br>Remanded.                                 | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of W. Allen Bryan,<br>III.   |
|---|---|---|---------|--|
| American Child Care, Inc.<br>v.<br>State of Tennessee, Department of<br>Human Services, et al.<br>M2000-01790-SC-R11-CV | Davidson Chancery<br>Ellen H. Lyle<br>00-413-III        | Cantrell, J.<br>Reversed and<br>Remanded.                                 | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of State of<br>Tennessee, Department of Human<br>Services, and Natasha K. Metcalf. |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Deadrick M. Pigg<br>M2000-03056-SC-R11-CD   | Davidson Criminal<br>Cherly Blackburn<br>2000-C-1314    | Welles, J.<br>Wade, J.<br>Smith, J.<br>Affirmed.                          | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Deadrick M.<br>Pigg.  |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Nordell Buggs<br>M2000-02759-SC-R11-CD  | Davidson Criminal<br>Carol Soloman<br>99-D-3045         | Williams, J.<br>Affirmed.   | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Nordell Buggs.  |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Timothy I. Robertson<br>M2000-01235-SC-R11-CD   | Davidson Criminal<br>J. Randall Wyatt, Jr.<br>99-B-1027 | Smith, J.<br>Affirmed.  | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Timothy I.<br>Robertson.  |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Steven Lloyd Givens<br>M2001-00021-SC-R11-CD  | Davidson Circuit<br>J. Randall Wyatt, Jr.<br>99-C-2110  | Welles, J.<br>Smith, J.<br>Witt, J.<br>Affirmed.                          | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Steven Lloyd Givens.  |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Rita Davis<br>M2000-03227-SC-R11-CD   | Marshall Circuit<br>Charles Lee<br>13809, 14296         | Hayes, J.<br>Reversed and<br>Remanded in Part<br>and Affirmed in<br>Part. | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Rita Davis.   |

| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Kenneth L. Boggs<br>M2000-02724-SC-R11-CD | Davidson Criminal<br>Seth Norman<br>99-B-1205      | Witt, J.<br>Welles, J.<br>Smith, J.<br>Affirmed.        | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Kenneth L.<br>Boggs. |
|---|--|---|---------|---|
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>John Malone<br>M2000-02265-SC-R11-CD      | Davidson Criminal<br>J. Randall Wyatt<br>99-C-2194 | Williams, J.<br>Affirmed.                               | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of John Malone.         |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Mikel U. Primm<br>M2001-02447-SC-R11-CD   | Dickson Circuit<br>Robert E. Burch<br>CR-5414      |   | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Mikel U.<br>Primm.   |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Jerry Breeding<br>M2001-00043-SC-R11-CD   | Overton Criminal<br>Leon C. Burns, Jr.<br>3820     | Williams, J.<br>Tipton, J.<br>Witt, J.<br>Affirmed.     | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Jerry Breeding.      |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Oscar Gomez<br>M2001-00130-SC-R11-CD      | Davidson Criminal<br>Walter Kurtz<br>99-C-1975     | Welles, J.<br>Affirmed.                                 | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Oscar Gomez.         |
| Kerry Jo Bradley<br>v.<br>State of Tennessee<br>M2000-02222-SC-R11-PC | Maury Criminal<br>Robert L. Jones<br>10402         | Williams, J.<br>Wade, J.<br>Tipton, J.<br>Affirmed.     | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Kerry Jo<br>Bradley. |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Tommy Lee Page<br>M2001-01046-SC-R11-CO   | Davidson Criminal<br>Seth W. Norman<br>95-D-1955   | Welles, J.<br>Woodall, J.<br>Wedemeyer, J.<br>Affirmed. | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Tommy Lee<br>Page.   |

| Harold Dennis Shores, Jr.<br>v.<br>Stephanie Rene Bonds<br>W2001-01514-SC-R11-JV  | Shelby Juvenile<br>Blancett<br>M3374                             | Lillard, J.<br>Crawford, J.<br>Dismissed.                     | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Harold Dennis<br>Shores, Jr.            |
|---|--|---|---------|--|
| Tennessee Wildlife Resources<br>Agency, et al.<br>v.<br>Steve Davis<br>W2001-03016-S10-CV                                     | Benton Chancery<br>Ron E. Harmn<br>00-028                        | Lillard, J.<br>Crawford, J.<br>Denied Rule 10<br>Application. | Rule 10 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Tennessee<br>Wildlife Resources Agency. |
| Joan C. Schmitt<br>v.<br>James Charles Smith<br>In Re: S. Denise McCrary<br>v.<br>Joan Carol Schmitt<br>W2000-01726-SC-R11-CV | Shelby Circuit<br>George H. Brown, Jr.<br>158942-6               | Farmer, J.<br>Vacated and<br>Remanded.                        | Rule 11 | Granted - Application of S. Denise<br>McCrary.                         |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Ronald Cox<br>W2000-02238-SC-R11-CD   | Shelby Criminal<br>Joseph B. Dailey<br>99-02650 & 99-02770       | Woodall, J.<br>Reversed and<br>Remanded.                      | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of State of Tennessee.                     |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Dale Godwin<br>W2001-00212-SC-R11-CD  | Obion Circuit<br>William B. Acree, Jr.<br>9654, 9655, 9656, 9713 | Wedemeyer, J.<br>Affirmed.                                    | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Dale Godwin.                            |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Johnny White<br>W2001-02174-SC-R11-CD   | Shelby Criminal<br>P-25268                                       | Hayes, J.<br>Denied Motion to<br>Late File Appeal.            | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Johnny White.                           |

| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Lewis A. Forbes<br>W2001-00202-SC-R11-CD                        | Tipton Circuit<br>Joseph H. Walker, III<br>3977-3978 | Wade, J.<br>Affirmed.    | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Lewis A.<br>Forbes.       |
|---|--|--------------------------|---------|--|
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Charles David Vanderford<br>W2000-02639-SC-R11-CD               | Hardin Circuit<br>Charles C. McGinley<br>7329        | Ogle, J.<br>Affirmed.    | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Charles David Vanderford. |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>James Whitelow and Robert<br>Robertson<br>W2001-00713-SC-R11-CD | Lauderdale Circuit<br>Joe H. Walker, III<br>6214     | Riley, J.<br>Affirmed.   | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Robert Robertson.         |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Gregory Hollingsworth<br>W2000-01993-SC-R11-PC                  | Madison Circuit<br>Joe C. Morris<br>C-00-176         | Welles, J.<br>Affirmed.  | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Gregory<br>Hollingsworth, |
| Linda D. Mucisk<br>v.<br>Calvin L. Musick<br>E2001-01140-SC-R11-CV                          | Sullivan Chancery<br>John S. McLellan, III<br>30263  | Franks, J.<br>Affirmed.  | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Calvin L.<br>Musick.      |
| State Ex Rel Steven M.<br>Wrzesniewski<br>v.<br>Lori Miller<br>E2001-00317-SC-R11-CV        | Blount Circuit<br>William D. Young<br>E-17018        | Franks, J.<br>Affirmed.  | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Lori Miller.              |
| Alvin Bates<br>v.<br>Dr. Joseph Metcalf, IV, et al.<br>E2001-00358-SC-R11-CV                | Anderson Circuit<br>James B. Scott, Jr.<br>98LA0448  | Goddard, J.<br>Affirmed. | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Alvin Bates.              |

| Anthony McNabb, et al.<br>v.<br>Highways, Inc., et al.<br>E2001-00867-SC-R11-CV | Polk Circuit<br>Lawrence H. Puckett<br>3596 & 3597 | Franks, J.<br>Vacated and<br>Remanded. | Rule 11 | <b>Granted</b> - Application of Highways,<br>Inc. <sup>1</sup>  |
|---|--|--|---------|---|
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Donald R. Eady<br>E2000-01152-SC-R11-CD             | Bradley Circuit<br>Carroll L. Ross<br>M-97-528     | Wedemeyer, J.<br>Affirmed.             | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Donald R. Eady.  |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Robbie Bailey<br>E2001-00210-SC-R11-CD              | Washington Criminal<br>Robert E. Cupp<br>26013     | Hayes, J.<br>Affirmed.                 | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Robbie Bailey.   |
| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Garland Godsey                                      | Cumberland Circuit<br>Leon C. Burns, Jr.<br>4969   | Witt, J.<br>Affirmed.                  | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Garland<br>Godsey. It is recommended that the<br>opinion of the Court of Criminal Appeals<br>be published. |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>For oral argument, the Court is particularly interested in the following issues:

<sup>1.</sup> Whether the Court of Appeals erred in reversing the trial curt's dismissal of the case based on the plaintiff's failure to comply with the rule adopted in <u>Samuelson v. McMurtry</u>, 962 S.W. 2d 473, 476 (Tenn. 1998) that "where the separate, independent negligent acts of more than one tortfeasor combine to cause a single, indivisible injury, all tortfeasors must be joined in the same action, unless joinder is specifically prohibited by law.

<sup>2.</sup> How does Tenn. R. Civ. P. 19.03 apply to this case?

The parties are directed to file supplemental briefs addressing the second issue, and may, if they choose, file a supplemental brief on the first issue as well.

| State of Tennessee<br>v.<br>Ricky Harris<br>E1999-02771-SC-R11-PC         | Carter Circuit<br>R. Jerry Beck<br>10297   | Tipton, J.<br>Ogle, J.<br>Rule 28 Granted. | Rule 11 | <b>Granted</b> - Application of State of Tennessee. <sup>2</sup> |
|---|--|--|---------|--|
| Franklin Scott Keith<br>v.<br>State of Tennessee<br>E2001-00220-SC-R11-PC | Cocke Circuit<br>Rex Henry Ogle<br>26,1212 | Glenn, J.<br>Affirmed.                     | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Franklin Scott Keith.             |
| Jeffrey E. Dunlap<br>v.<br>State of Tennessee<br>E2001-00189-SC-R11-PC    | Knox Criminal<br>Ray L. Jenkins<br>68159   | Wade, J.<br>Affirmed.                      | Rule 11 | <b>Denied</b> - Application of Jeffrey E.<br>Dunlap.             |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>For oral argument, the Court is particularly interested in the following issue:

Did the Court of Criminal Appeals err in treating the petitioner's Motion to Reopen as a petition for writ of error coram nobis, and extending the due process rationale of <u>Workman v. State</u>, 41 S.W. 3d 100 (Tenn.2001) to a non-capital case in which the petitioner alleged the State withheld exculpatory evidence?